

Civilian ViewsThose job factors considered *unique* to the Police Force

	Total No. of Submissions
1. General Grades Officer	
(a) The requirement on discipline is stricter in disciplined settings.	(4)
(b) Need to be familiar with the Force orders and manuals.	(4)
(c) Job nature of some posts is obnoxious e.g. in handling property duties, some items may have come from the dead, and some clerical staff have to come into contact with prisoners and suspects.	(7)
	Total No. of Submissions
2. Police Translator	
(d) Prolonged working hours (e.g. working shifts, on-call) and need to handle personal information.	(8)
(e) Outdoor interpretation duties, and some in unpleasant surroundings, e.g. detention centers, cells.	(7)
(f) Encountering criminals and suspects.	(6)
(g) Translating pornographic, obscene statements, vogue languages, special jargons, legal or medical terms.	(6)
(h) Stress from heavy workload and perfect accuracy requirement as work products (translated document and interpretations) will be challenged in legal proceedings.	(1)
	Total No. of Submissions
3. Traffic Warden	
(i) A unique civilian grade which is bound by disciplined regulations. Most proposals in the consultation paper will not be applicable to the grade.	
(j) Need to work shifts, wear uniform and bound by laws and regulations.	(13)
(k) Dangerous duties (being bit by dogs or attacked when issuing penalty tickets).	(13)
	Total No. of Submissions

4. Armourers

- (l) The uniqueness of the Armourer grade and significant supportive role the grade has played in Police work have to be recognized. There has not been any failure incident during frontline operations in the past is due to the very good technical maintenance and good order of all Arms and Ammunition. (16)
- (m) Workload in the Armourer grade has increased tremendously with the growing professionalism and changing image of the Police Force. (16)
- (n) For matching up with the increasing professionalism in the Force, armoury work has become more complexed and technical. It imposes greater demand on the armourers, and the staff have to pursue special qualifications (e.g. Explosive and range officer qualifications) to meet the job requirements. (16)
- (o) The armourer grade should be treated fairly to take into account their uniqueness and scarcity of supply of experienced and skilful personnel in the private market. (16)
- (p) Default in the arms can be fatal. The 'zero defect' requirement on armoury has been causing a huge psychological pressure on the armourers. (16)
- (q) Considerable danger in handling loaded arms during testing and repair maintenance. (16)
- (r) Being bound by Civil Service Regulations, technical skills cannot be easily transferred. (16)
- (s) It is difficult to recruit suitable armoury personnel in the private market. The Department has to put in a large amount of training resources in the grade, and due to limited size of the grade, mobility and promotion prospects in the grade are limited. (16)

ON PAY POLICIES, PAY SYSTEM AND PAY STRUCTURE

(a) Should there be a major overhaul

Total No. of Submissions

Yes (9)
No (147)

- ◆ Support payment cash wages in lieu of allowances. (2)
- ◆ New pay system should only apply to new employees. (1)
- ◆ A major overhaul of the civil service pay policy and system means an exploitation of the benefits for all existing civil servants. Fringe benefits in private sectors also include housing, medical and other benefits. The proposal is not supported. (14)

(b) Should there be different pay policy for the senior and middle / junior ranks?

Total No. of Submissions

Yes (17)
No (59)

- ◆ The existing pay policy to senior civil servants is already different from that of the middle-ranking and junior ranks. For example, the rate of pay adjustments and the fringe benefits of housing and other allowances. (14)

(c) Should the pay for disciplined services treated differently

Total No. of Submissions

Yes (66)
No (8)

- ◆ The question in English version is asking the "pay" to disciplined services whereas the same question in Chinese version is asking for comments on the "pay policy" to disciplined services. For the "pay" to disciplined services, it should be different to the rest of the civil service as the natures of the jobs are not the same. Therefore, there should be a separate policy on "pay system" to disciplined services. (14)

(d) Conduct of regular pay level, pay structure and pay trend surveys to ensure civil service pay remains comparable with the private sector

Total No. of Submissions

Yes (73)
No (75)

◆ Delinking of civil service pay with that of private sectors because civil servants aim at serving the community while private organizations aim at making profit (1)

◆ The rationale of the pay structure is not certain. Since the Government has not followed the results of the pay trend surveys in the past, especially in the era of economic bloom, the pay trend surveys should be abolished. Instead, it is recommended to make the pay adjustments in accordance with the annual inflation / deflation. (14)

(e) **Should Government's affordability be an over-riding consideration in pay adjustment**

Total No. of Submissions

Yes (9)
No (96)

◆ Purpose of civil service pay adjustments is to maintain the stability of the Government and ensure the service provided by Government to be continued. Government's affordability should not be an over-riding consideration.

(f) **Features of existing pay policy and system to be retained**

Total No. of Submissions

◆ The following elements of the existing pay policy and system should be retained to ensure stability and morale of the civil service –

(i) Anything related to pension

(ii) Fringe benefits such as quarters

(iii) There should not be downward salary adjustments

(iv) There is currently a fair system for determining the salary level of each rank, according to the educational requirement and job complexity, etc of that rank. Such a system should be maintained.

(v) Increments, stable and reasonably attractive salary package.

◆ Entry qualifications should be taken into account in the review. (6)

◆ Fundamental changes to existing system requires a longer transitional period. (1)

◆ To maintain a competitive pay package to attract the most suitable candidates to work in the government. (30)

(II) ON REPLACING FIXED PAY SCALES WITH PAY RANGES

(a) Would flexible pay ranges bring benefits?

Total No. of Submissions

Yes (10)
No (153)

◆ Introduction of flexible pay ranges would not bring benefits in terms of better rewarding performance and enhancing a performance-oriented culture in the Hong Kong context for the following reasons -

(i) The successful introduction of pay ranges depends much on a fair appraisal system. However, no matter what the appraisal system is, it can still be easily manipulated.

(ii) Workloads of officers depend on factors outside their control.

(b) Flexible pay ranges will lead to potential divisiveness among civil servants?

Total No. of Submissions

Yes (23)
No (9)

(c) Flexible pay ranges to be applied to entire civil service?

Total No. of Submissions

Yes (81)
No (14)

◆ Should apply to senior civil servants who have heavier management responsibilities. (36)

◆ The middle-ranking and junior rank staff are taking instructions from the senior officers, the flexible pay rank should not apply to these two groups of officers. (16)

(d) Flexible pay ranges to be applied to both civilian and disciplined officers

Total No. of Submissions

Yes (3)
No (40)

(e) **Changes to existing performance measurement and appraisal system to support introduction of flexible pay range**

	Total No. of Submissions
◆ Careful and formal job evaluation has to be conducted for the Performance-based system.	(1)
◆ The most important thing is to ensure existing performance measurement is carried out.	(14)
◆ Limited pay ranges in combination with a reduced pay increment system is considered fairer and safer.	(1)

(f) **Performance management system will not be the most effective way to nurture a performance culture**

	Total No. of Submissions
◆ A better way to encourage good performance is better promotion system with adequate promotion opportunities.	(35)
◆ There are existing provisions for stoppage and deferment of increment.	(42)
◆ Pay ranges would affect the stability of officers' income	(22)
◆ Will encourage ingratitude, a culture of flattery, pretentiousness and pomposity.	(52)
◆ Will result in abuse of authority by supervisory officers and create a subservient culture.	(2)

III) ON PAY ADJUSTMENT SYSTEM AND MECHANISM

(a) Adherence to the principle of broad comparability with the private sector

	Total No. of Submissions
	Yes (22)
	No (6)
◆ Change should only apply to senior civil servants.	(4)
◆ All civil servants should be under same payment adjustment system to avoid divisiveness.	(2)
◆ Some work type/personnel do not have comparables in the private sector e.g. Armourers.	(16)

(b) Is existing pay adjustment system fair?

	Total No. of Submissions
	Yes (130)
	No (5)
◆ Any other mechanism will serve the purpose better – No.	(75)
◆ The problem is that Government has not followed the pay trend surveys in the past years.	(14)

(c) Is there a need for changing or introducing more flexibility?

	Total No. of Submissions
	Yes (8)
	No (21)

(d) Fiscal constraint an over-riding factor in determining pay adjustment?

	Total No. of Submissions
	Yes (69)
	No (71)
◆ Reasons for 'No' are -	(16)
(i) Given the fact that many of the government's expenditure items, such as education and social welfare, the amounts are not controllable, the fluctuations in government's revenue, would have a tremendous impact on civil servants' salaries if financial consideration is a factor.	

- (ii) There are better ways to reduce government expenditure, such as outsourcing of services and streamlining of procedures. They are many other effective ways than reducing civil servants' salaries which would have a severe impact on the morale and stability.
- (iii) It is the upper management's responsibility in tackling the problem of government's deficit in revenue. The proposed way simply means that the government denies this responsibility and leaves it to the junior civil servants to bear the consequences of their inability.
- (iv) There have been incidents where wrong decisions of the government were causing loss to the revenue, e.g., sale of land with an extraordinarily low price. It would be unfair to civil servants if they are to bear the consequences.
- (v) Some officers agreed to the notion that civil servants' pay should be in line with the economic position. However, they have no confidence of there being a fair system by which civil servants could get their justified share of the pie when the economic situation starts to revive. They supported their point by quoting incidents in the 1980s and 1990s when the pay rises of civil servants were reduced to a lower level than the figures from the pay trend survey.
- (vi) The notion of staff's salaries to vary with the revenue should apply to profit-making organizations only which the government does not belong to.

- ◆ The reasons of Government facing fiscal difficulty is due to the wrong economic policy in which its major income relies mainly on the sale of land. When the economy is at its valley, the Government should expand instead of slimming in order to encourage internal consumption. The whole logic of this Review is wrong.

(14)

(e) Pay administration to be decentralized to departments?

Total No. of Submissions

No (26)

- ◆ The Government as a whole should have a centrally controlled pay system. The decentralization of this authority to departments (as can be seen in the employment of NCSC staff) will lead to competitions among Government departments and wastage of public resources.

(14)

(IV) ON INTRODUCING PERFORMANCE-BASED REWARDS

(a) Merit to incorporate elements of performance pay in civil service salaries

Total No. of Submissions

Yes (23)
No (171)

◆ Reasons for 'No' are –

- (i) As civil servants' duties are not profit-making in nature, it is hard to set objective and quantitative performance targets.
- (ii) An officer's ability to attain a target is not only affected by his capability and potential, but also depends on many factors outside their control such as the workload of the unit concerned.
- (iii) Will funding be a problem to implement the new arrangements?
- (iv) Mutual-cooperation may be discouraged, if the rewards were to be given in the form of prizes of competitions.

Other views –

- ◆ Full implementation of performance-based awards is unnecessary and unsuitable for the following reasons : (6)
 - (i) the current system has incorporated elements of performance pay.
 - (ii) high-handed supervisors might emerge as they can get control over the salaries of their subordinates.
 - (iii) Job nature and complexity varies from one department/unit to another, in particular for general grades officers.
- ◆ Good in theory, but difficult to implement. (1)
- ◆ Introduction of performance-based award will lead to corruption. (19)
- ◆ A performance-based system should be fair, stable and transparent. (15)
- ◆ Team-based performance rewards and individual performance rewards cannot be applied to Traffic Wardens because of nature of their work, and the enforcement duties they have to perform. (1)

(b) Other Forms of performance-based rewards?

	Total No. of Submissions
	Yes, needed (3)
	No, not needed (9)
◆ Monetary rewards are not primary concern for some civil servants. Their performance would better be boosted by other things such as better morale and image among the public. Unfortunately, the things that the government has done are ruining them.	(21)
◆ As there is no conclusion that there is a need to introduce 'pay ranges' and that the existing system is considered effective, there is no need to consider other forms of performance-based rewards.	(14)

(c) Should team-based performance rewards be used?

	Total No. of Submissions
	Yes (5)
	No (67)
◆ It should apply to all levels.	(91)
◆ Preferred team-based performance reward scheme on basis of department as a whole, and wide consultation should be carried out.	(85)
◆ Existing mechanism of the civil service is already working on team-based. If team-based spirit is built on monetary interest, it will inevitably lead to diversification and co-operation among civil service and departments. The Government will be no longer efficient.	(14)

(d) Should individual performance rewards be introduced?

	Total No. of Submissions
	Yes (55)
	No (54)
◆ Existing system has already element of individual rewards. The best way to mobilize civil servants is to enhance promotion prospect. To build a new system is wasting efforts.	(14)
◆ If performance award is to be introduced, it should be team-based instead of individual-based.	(45)
◆ It should apply to all levels.	(74)
◆ Criteria for rewards should be clearly spelt out and objective.	

(e) What further changes are needed to support the introduction of performance-related pay?

	Total No. of Submissions
	Changes are needed (23)
	Changes are not needed (18)
◆ Provided that there are objective performance criteria and a comprehensive monitoring system to avoid corruption or favouritism, the performance-based awards system can be implemented.	(5)
◆ A pilot scheme should be conducted in the Civil Service Bureau first.	(1)
◆ The existing pay system is already a performance-related system. Comparing with private sector, the Government's staff appraisal system is a rather heavy workload to civil servants as each appraisal report contains over 10 pages. It is necessary to review the entire appraisal system should the Government wants to learn from the private sector its efficiency in human resource management.	(14)

(V) ON SIMPLIFICATION AND DECENTRALIZATION OF PAY ADMINISTRATION

(a) Should decentralization of civil service pay administration be introduced in Hong Kong

Total No. of Submissions

Yes (2)

No (176)

◆ Reasons not in support are –

(i) If departments are delegated with pay administration authority, officers of the same grade may have different salaries in different department, this is unfair.

(ii) If Heads of Departments are delegated the authority to allocate resources freely, preference would be give to departmental grades, the interests of general and common grades would be jeopardized.

(iii) The bargaining power of the staff of a particular department would be weak. Unlike the existing system where the Central Staff Councils/Associations would step in and do the bargain for the staff.

◆ Current pay administration is simple and effective, decentralization will proliferate problem, and is considered unnecessary. (1)

◆ Too sensitive a topic to discuss at the moment. (1)

◆ Decentralization will cause more administrative work and not value for money. Departments, in order to show 'good financial management', will not undertake pay adjustment, but this will be unfair to the staff in that particular department. (1)

◆ Decentralization will lead to competition of public resources. (14)

(b) How much pay and grading responsibility should be devolved to departments?

No comments

(c) Should some of the current general/common grades staff be departmentalized to facilitate department-based management?

Total No. of Submissions

Support (9)

Do not Support (140)

◆ If department-based management is to be introduced, it is inevitable that some of the current general/common grades have to be departmentalized. The clerical and secretarial grades would be the ones to be picked. However, the change will affect their mobility, career development and promotion prospects. The general grades have a legitimate expectation in these respects, and the management should respect to their rights.

- ◆ There are scope for some specialized jobs in the general grades in the Force to be departmentalised. Examples are clerks in property and crime offices. While saying so, the staff are worried that their chance for transfer, to other jobs outside department will be jeopardized. Department will be more difficult to carry out contracting-out initiatives if the flexibility of postings to other departments is restricted.
- ◆ Work of the Executive Officers are of wide range, including finance, personnel, systems management, planning etc. Development through postings in these fields are necessary in the bring-up of the Executive members, and departmentalized of the grade will not be able to provide sufficient exposure for them.

(d) How morale and standard of service be maintained during the transition period?

- | | Total No. of Submissions |
|---|--------------------------|
| ◆ Suggestions are – | (85) |
| Government to introduce the following measures to maintain the standard of service and staff morale : | |
| ✓ Giving exit channel for those who are unwilling to stay, e.g. Voluntary Retirement Scheme | |
| ✓ Giving constant updates on the development to staff | |
| ✓ Not affecting by the politics | |
| ◆ It is difficult to guarantee the standard of service and staff morale during the transition period, decentralization is unwise and impracticable. | (14) |

(e) Scope for amalgamate existing grades?

- | | Total No. of Submissions | |
|--|--------------------------|------|
| ◆ One suggestion is to amalgamate the grades of Confidential Assistant/Supplies Supervisor II/Assistant Clerical Officer | Yes | (84) |
| | No | (5) |
| ◆ Scope for flatter organizations with wider span of management control and fewer rank layers? | Yes | (71) |
| | No | (7) |

(f) Whether the formal job evaluation system, if introduced, be operated centrally or at departmental level?

- | | Total No. of Submissions | |
|--|--------------------------|------|
| Yes | | (58) |
| – centrally (18/14 (for general grades)) | | |
| – departmental level (28) | | |
| No | | (50) |
| ◆ Level of delegation should be made at an appropriate level and be clearly defined. | | (4) |

Views from Major Civilian Staff Associations

Hong Kong Traffic Wardens Union

- ◆ Traffic Warden is a unique civilian grade that is bound by disciplined regulations. Most of the proposals in the paper are not applicable to them.
- ◆ Team-based performance rewards and individual performance rewards are not applicable to their scope of work and should not be introduced.
- ◆ The consultation is only a gesture to collect public opinions. They wonder if the Administration would consider comments from civil servants. He said that the Administration did not consider staff morale as reflected at its determination to effect pay cut through legislative procedures.

Association of Police Communications Officers

- ◆ The consultation is only a gesture to collect public opinions. They wonder if the Administration would consider comments from civil servants.

HKPF Model Scale I Staff Association

- ◆ Chairman of the HKPF Model Scale I Staff Association said that they would send their views to the Government Employees Association for onward transmission to the Joint Secretariat. Generally speaking, the Association agree that fine-tuning of the civil service system is required in view of changes in the local economy. Yet the proposed civil service pay policy and system should not be made for yielding to public pressure without considering the rights of the civil servants. The review should be aimed to maintain a stable civil service and must be made on a fair basis and carried out gradually to avoid unnecessary speculation and instability. All staff associations should be consulted and an agreement should be reached through effective liaison and communications in order not to adversely affect the morale of the civil servants.

General Grades Staff Associations/PCSCC

- ◆ There is scope to amalgamate some existing grades within broader occupational categories, such as the Typist and the Clerical Assistant grades.

- ◆ Officers' views are diversified on question of whether some or all of the current general grades should be departmentalised. The advocates consider that it would facilitate department-based management and some of the specialized posts such as clerks working at property room and crime office can be departmentalised. While officers who are against the proposal consider that their right of applying for transfer out of a department would be jeopardized and the promotion prospect of those officers working at small-sized departments would be adversely affected. Officers express their worries towards this proposal. They questioned the merits and practicability of the proposal.